

C I V I L I A N R E V I E W B O A R D
PUBLIC SESSION MINUTES
July 18, 2019

Present at the meeting were Civilian Review Board members Mel Currie (Southwestern), Ebony Harvin (Southern District), George Buntin (Western), Fred Jackson (Northwestern District) and Marcus Nole (Eastern District).

Also present were:

Amy Cruice, ACLU
John Wesley, Public Information Officer
Raemond Parrott, Deputy Director
Raymond Lloyd, Public Integrity Bureau
Kobi Little, NAACP
Cedric McCray, Deputy Director

Members of the public and community members were also present.

I. Welcome and Introductions

Mel Currie welcomed everyone and called the meeting to order at 6:28. He recognized and introduced non-voting members of the Board and staff. He noted that the meeting was being recorded.

II. Director's Report

Director Ingram gave a statistical update on new complaints and investigations.

He noted the following events:

- The last “Can We Talk?” Event was on Women and Entrepreneurship on July 16th at The Living Well.
- On July 2nd, staff attended the Immigrant Community Public Meeting. Mayor Young and Commissioner Harrison addressed concerns of the immigrant community in a public meeting. This meeting is the second “MIMA in the Community” meeting, which are biannual opportunities for the public to engage directly with the work of government. The Director provided guidance on how individuals can file complaints when officers violate BPD’s policy regarding their interactions with ICE
- On July 13th to 14th the Office participated in Baltimore/Washington One Caribbean Carnival/ Festival 2019 - Clifton Park - 2801 Harford Road
 - *Saturday, 7/13: 12:00 pm – 10:00 pm*
 - *Sunday, 7/14: 12:00 pm – 4:00 pm (need support 4:00 pm – 9:00 pm)*
- On July 24th, 10:00 am – 2:00 pm the Office will hold a Disabilities Resource Fair. The fair will be located at Cherry Hill Elementary School at 801 Bridgeview Rd, Brooklyn, MD 21225. The purpose of the fair is the following:
 - To promote resources for persons with disabilities
 - Invite service providers, local, state and federal agencies to share information
 - Provide a one-stop-shop for resources for city residents including children, parents, adults, caregivers and older citizens

- Provide resources for expungements and assistive technology demonstrations.
- Encourage service providers [at nursing homes, senior centers and day programs] to bring their clients
- Campaign and advocate for persons with disabilities
- CRB Staff will be attending the NACOLE Annual Conference from September 21-26 in Detroit. Registration is still open.
- Civil Rights Week will take place from September 27th – October 5th, and the office is accepting sponsorships.
- The Office of Civil Rights will have a table at Artscape from July 19-22.
- July 1st began the new fiscal year and staff met to discuss goals and strategies. The CRB will be having an administrative meeting on August 1st to discuss new initiatives and strategies as well.

Director Ingram noted that implementation of the CRB/OPR Protocol has begun, Unified Complaint Forms are being used, staff has had training on IAPro and was granted access to the system. He noted that on July 30th staff will receive training on evidence.com in order to retrieve body worn camera footage.

Director Ingram noted that the CRB is pushing to hold more events in communities, rather than at the office, and asked that members continue to identify places in their community that can hold CRB meetings. Acceptable sites should be handicap accessible, low or no cost, and able to hold at least 35 people and provide tables and chairs. Locations with on-site parking and with a large constituent community that they can invite are ideal.

III. Approval of the Minutes from June 20, 2019

Mel Currie motioned to approve the minutes from June 20, 2019. Betty Robinson seconded, and all were in favor.

IV. New Complaints

CRB2019-0050

A majority of Board members voted to authorize an independent CRB investigation.

CRB2019-0115

A majority of Board members voted to authorize an independent CRB investigation.

CRB2019-0125

A majority of Board members voted to authorize an independent CRB investigation.

CRB2019-0126

A majority of Board members voted to authorize an independent CRB investigation.

CRB2019-0127

A majority of Board members voted to authorize an independent CRB investigation.

CRB2019-0136

A majority of Board members voted to authorize an independent CRB investigation.

CRB2019-0143

A majority of Board members voted to authorize an independent CRB investigation.

V. Executive Session

Board members met in executive session to review body worn camera footage for case CRB2019-0020.

Time of closed session: 6:29 PM

Place: 7 E Redwood Street, 9th floor Baltimore MD 21202

Purpose(s): To review body worn camera footage for case CRB2019-0020

Members who voted to meet in closed session: Mel Currie, Marcus Nole, Fred Jackson, Ebony Harvin

Persons attending closed session: Mel Currie, Marcus Nole, Fred Jackson, Ebony Harvin

Authority under § 3-305 for the closed session: (b)(13)

Topics actually discussed: None- Footage Reviewed

Actions taken: None- Footage Reviewed

Each recorded vote: N/A

VI. Completed Investigations

<u>CRB#</u>	<u>IAD#</u>	<u>Allegations</u>	<u>Findings</u>
CRB2018-0020	18-0071	FA FI H	NS

Ebony Harvin noted that the IAD report stated that the officer saw half of the gun hanging out of the compartment in the glovebox, which is how he discovered it. She noted that the video showed the gun was there. Fred Jackson stated that those compartments are common, land that many mechanic shops will put them in. He noted that although the complainant was saying it wasn't his car, anything in the car is attributed to him, and the arrest was legitimate. Marcus Nole noted that the gun had to have already been there before they got there because of how they had to wedge it out. Fred Jackson noted that the officers had no time to plant a gun. Ebony Harvin noted that there was a time discrepancy in the video between the two officers and asked why. Lt. Fernandez noted that this could relate to officer's keeping time with their cell phone. **A majority of Board members voted not to sustain the allegations.**

CRB2018-0043	18-0166	H	NS
--------------	---------	---	----

Ebony Harvin felt that she did not have enough information. She noted that she did see that the person was under federal investigation and wanted to know if it was policy in the City to place tracking devices on their car. Lt. Fernandez noted that depending on what the investigation is, any law enforcement agency can place a tracking device on the car with a court order. Marcus Nole noted that this case was administratively closed by the CRB investigator due to their

inability to contact the complainant as a result of their recent incarceration. He stated that he did not see enough to sustain. **A majority of Board members voted not to sustain the allegations.**

CRB2018-0065

18-00500

AL FI

NS

Marcus Nole felt that they did not have all of the evidence needed to make the determination. He noted that when officers conduct a traffic stop, they usually signal for someone to pull over, but in this case, the person was blocked in. Lt. Fernandez noted that in that case, they would normally just turn on the light. Marcus Nole stated that he felt it was unnecessary to pull the person over for tinted windows, but did not feel that the standard for false imprisonment was met, or that the conversation was belittling to the complainant. Ebony Harvin noted that the times on the body worn camera footage were different again in this case. Mel Currie noted that the sergeant first claimed he did not see inappropriate language being used, but then later stated that he did, but it was classified as conduct unbecoming an officer. Ebony Harvin noted that she would recommend training. **A majority of Board members voted not to sustain the allegations.** Amy Cruice asked if the Board would receive more body worn camera footage in the future, and Jill Muth answered that they were working through technological issues.

CRB2018-0067

18-0037

AL EF

NS

Fred Jackson felt that the complaint was not credible, and noted that the officer knew the complainant's license was suspended and was watching to see if he would drive the car. He noted that the complainant claimed officer cocked his gun, but officers do not carry revolvers that can be cocked. He noted that the lawyer did not claim to have seen anything. Marcus Nole noted that eyewitnesses corroborated the complainant's account, but CCTV and the lawyer's statement did not. Mel Currie noted that the complainant made false claims about what the witnesses saw. **A majority of Board members voted not to sustain the allegations.**

VII. Public Comment

Ebony Harvin introduced a group of students from Indianapolis from an organization called "Stop the Violence" that works with youth to expose them to social justice in different environments. She noted that they will also be going to Philadelphia and New York.

One of the students asked why it's accepted for multiple officers to approach a subject, and noted that he felt body worn cameras should be turned on when the officer turns their lights on. Lt. Fernandez stated that multiple officers approach for officer safety, and that since the first level of force is sheer numbers, the more officers present, the less likely the civilian is going to get hurt. He noted that units work as teams, and when one car pulls someone over, other cars will respond. He stated that in Baltimore City, cameras are not tied to cars, but have to be manually turned on by the officer. The student noted that it is uncomfortable to be pulled over by multiple officers, and can make him feel unsafe. Director Ingram noted that policing tactics depended on communities and cultures, and that this could be an opportunity for advocacy. Kobi Little encouraged representatives from BPD to listen actively to what community members were saying and respect that police officers can make them feel unsafe, given the history of police interactions with communities of color.

Michele Herring brought flyers and posters for the upcoming Baltimore CeaseFire, which would be celebrating its second anniversary in August. She noted that shootings have dropped by 60% on Ceasefire weekends. Ebony Harvin stated that she has noticed positive change in the community over the past several months.

Amy Cruice noted that it is important to find examples of where positive change has happened. She noted that in Richmond California, they made the officers state their name and why they were pulling the person over, which resulted in reduced complaints and uses of force.

VIII. Old Business

There was no old business.

IX. New Business

Jill Muth noted that the new OPr/CRB liaison would be introduced to the Board at their administrative meeting on August 1st.

X. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 7:48 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Jill Muth